

**IN THE
UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA**

Docket No. 04-5393

DONALD H. RUMSFELD, *ET AL.*,
Appellants,

v.

SALIM AHMED HAMDAN,
Appellee.

**On Appeal From the United States District Court
for the District of Columbia
Case No. 04cv01519**

**BRIEF OF AMICUS CURIAE
THE AMERICAN CENTER FOR LAW & JUSTICE
SUPPORTING APPELLANTS & REVERSAL
OF LOWER COURT RULING**

JAY ALAN SEKULOW
STUART J. ROTH
JAMES M. HENDERSON, SR.
(DC Bar # 452639)
(Counsel of Record)
ROBERT W. ASH
AMERICAN CENTER FOR
LAW AND JUSTICE
201 MARYLAND AVE., NE
WASHINGTON, DC 20002
(202) 546-8890
(202) 546-9309 (FAX)

Attorneys for Amicus Curiae

Scheduled for Oral Argument on Tuesday, March 8, 2005, at 9:30 a.m.

CERTIFICATE AS TO PARTIES, RULINGS, AND RELATED CASES

(A) Parties and Amici. All parties, intervenors, and *amici* appearing before the district court and in this court are listed in the Brief for Appellants.

Corporate Disclosure Statement

The American Center for Law and Justice (ACLJ) is a public interest law firm incorporated in Virginia. It is tax exempt under Internal Revenue Code 501(a) as an organization described in section 501(c)(3). The ACLJ has no parent companies and issues no stock. The ACLJ exists, *inter alia*, to defend human and civil rights and the separation of powers.

(B) Rulings Under Review. References to the rulings at issue appear in the Brief for Appellants.

(C) Related Cases. This case was previously before the United States District Court for the District of Columbia (Case No. 04cv01519).

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
CERTIFICATE AS TO PARTIES, RULINGS, AND RELATED CASES.....	ii
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	iii
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES.....	v
GLOSSARY.....	x
INTEREST OF <i>AMICUS</i>	1
STATEMENT OF FACTS.....	1
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT.....	3
ARGUMENT.....	4
I. HISTORICAL PRECEDENT CONFIRMS THAT THE PRESIDENT HAS CONGRESSIONAL AUTHORIZATION TO ESTABLISH MILITARY COMMISSIONS UNDER 10 U.S.C. § 821.....	4
II. UNLAWFUL BELLIGERENTS DO NOT QUALIFY AS PRISONERS OF WAR UNDER GENEVA CONVENTION III (GPW).....	8
III. GPW ARTICLE 5, WHICH ALLOWS A CAPTIVE TO CHALLENGE HIS ARTICLE 4 STATUS, IS NARROWLY DRAWN.....	12
IV. THE PRESIDENT, AS COMMANDER-IN-CHIEF, IS RESPONSIBLE TO DETERMINE THE CHARACTER OF BELLIGERENTS, A DETERMINATION WHICH COURTS MUST RESPECT BASED ON SEPARATION OF POWERS.....	15
V. THE MILITARY COMMISSIONS WILL PROVIDE FAIR TRIALS.....	19
CONCLUSION.....	21

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE.....	23
CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE WITH RULE 32(a).....	24

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES	Page(s)
<i>Aktepe v. United States</i> , 105 F.3d 1400 (11th Cir. 1997).....	16
<i>Ange v. Bush</i> , 752 F. Supp. 509 (D.D.C. 1990).....	7
<i>Baker v. Carr</i> , 369 U.S. 186 (1962).....	19
<i>Bas v. Tingy</i> , 4 U.S. (4 Dall.) 37 (1800).....	7
<i>Chicago & S. Airlines, Inc. v. Waterman S.S. Co.</i> , 333 U.S. 103 (1948).....	17, 18
<i>Coleman v. Miller</i> , 307 U.S. 433 (1939).....	17
* <i>Ex Parte Quirin</i> , 317 U.S. 1 (1942).....	4, 5, 6, 8, 9, 10
<i>Haig v. Agee</i> , 453 U.S. 280 (1981).....	7, 16
<i>Hamilton. v. Ky. Distilleries & Whiskey Co.</i> , 251 U.S. 146 (1919).....	16
<i>Harisiades v. Shaughnessy</i> , 342 U.S. 580 (1952).....	7
<i>Hirabayashi v. United States</i> , 320 U.S. 81 (1943).....	16, 18
<i>In Re Yamashita</i> , 327 U.S. 1 (1946).....	16
<i>Kennedy v. Mendoza-Martinez</i> , 372 U.S. 144 (1963).....	18
<i>Lowry v. Reagan</i> , 676 F.Supp. 333 (D.D.C. 1987).....	7
<i>Mitchell v. Laird</i> , 488 F.2d 611 (D.C. Cir. 1973).....	7
<i>Oetjen v. Cent. Leather Co.</i> , 246 U.S. 297 (1918).....	17

<i>Orlando v. Laird</i> , 443 F.2d 1039 (2d Cir. 1971).....	7
<i>People’s Mujahadeen Org. v. U.S. Dep’t of State</i> , 182 F.3d 17 (D.C. Cir. 1999).....	18
<i>Roegle v. Fed. Open Mkt. Comm.</i> , 656 F.2d 873 (D.C. Cir.), <i>cert. denied</i> , 454 U.S. 1082 (1981).....	7, 8
<i>Sanchez-Espinosa v. Reagan</i> , 568 F. Supp. 596 (D.D.C. 1983).....	7
<i>Stewart v. Kahn</i> , 78 U.S. (11 Wall.) 493 (1871).....	16
<i>The Pedro</i> , 175 U.S. 354 (1899).....	6
<i>The Prize Cases</i> , 67 U.S. (2 Black) 635 (1863).....	6, 7, 15, 16
<i>United States v. Curtiss-Wright Exp. Corp.</i> , 299 U.S. 304 (1936).....	17
OTHER FEDERAL SOURCES	
* 10 U.S.C. § 821.....	4, 5, 6, 8
10 U.S.C. § 836.....	6
66 Fed. Reg. 57,833 (Nov. 16, 2001).....	3, 5, 6
Article of War 15.....	4, 5, 6
Dep’t of Defense Fact Sheet, <i>Military Commission Procedures</i>	20
Dep’t of Defense Military Commission Order No. 1 (March 21, 2002).....	20
H. Rpt. 491, Uniform Code of Military Justice, 81st Cong., 1st Sess. (April 28, 1949).....	5
Pub. L. No. 107-40, 115 Stat. 224 (2001).....	2, 7

Sen. Rpt., Establishing a Uniform Code of Military Justice, 81st Cong., 1st Sess. (June 10, 1949).....	5
---	---

INTERNATIONAL DOCUMENTS

* Annex to Hague Convention (IV) Respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land, Oct. 18, 1907, art. 1, 187 Consol. T.S. 227.....	9, 10, 11
---	-----------

Geneva Convention Relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War, Aug. 12, 1949, 74 U.N.T.S. 135.....	13, 14
--	--------

* Geneva Convention Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War, Aug. 12, 1949, 6 U.S.T. 3316, T.I.A.S. 3364.....	9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 15
---	-----------------------

Inter-American Treaty of Reciprocal Assistance, Sept. 2, 1947, art. 3(1), 62 Stat. 1681, 21 U.N.T.S. 77.....	8
--	---

International Committee of the Red Cross Commentary on the Third Geneva Convention.....	11, 14, 15
--	------------

North Atlantic Treaty, Apr. 4, 1949, 63 Stat. 2241, 34 U.N.T.S. 243.....	8
---	---

OAS Resolution on Terrorist Threat to the Americas, OEA/Ser.F/II.24, RC.24/RES.1/01, Sept. 21, 2001.....	8
---	---

Security Treaty Between Australia, New Zealand and the United States, Sept. 1, 1951, 131 U.N.T.S. 83.....	8
---	---

ARTICLES AND MISCELLANEOUS SOURCES

- Lee A. Casey, *et al.*, *Unlawful Belligerency and Its Implications Under International Law*, available at www.fed-soc.org/Publications/Terrorism/unlawfulcombatants.htm.....9, 11
- Mark Fineman & Stephen Braun, *After the Attack*, L.A. Times, Sept. 24, 2001, A1.....18
- Jack Goldsmith & Cass R. Sunstein, *Military Tribunals and Legal Culture: What a Difference Sixty Years Makes*, 19 Const. Comment. 261 (Spring 2002).....5
- Alexander Hamilton, *The Examination*, No. 1, 17 Dec. 1801, reprinted in 3 *The Founder's Constitution* (Kurland & Lerner eds., 1987).....8, 13
- William Rehnquist, *All the Laws But One: Civil Liberties in Wartime*.....16
- David B. Rivkin, Jr., & Lee A. Casey, *The Law and War*, pt. 1, Wash. Times, Jan. 26, 2004, at A19.....2
- David B. Rivkin, Jr., *et al.*, *The Law and War*, pt. 2, Wash. Times, Jan. 27, 2004, at A19.....13
- Luisa Vierucci, *What judicial treatment for the Guantanamo detainees?*, German L.J., vol. 3, no. 9 (Sept. 2002).....14

WEB RESOURCES

- <http://bcn.boulder.co.us/government/national/speeches/spch.html>.....6
- www.cbsnews.com/stories/2003/11/30/terror/main586001.shtml.....15

www.dailynews.com/socal/terrorist/0102/	
12/terror01.asp.....	2
www.defense.gov/transcripts/2004/tr20040921-	
secdef1323.html.....	21
www.defenselink.mil/speeches/2001/s20011003-	
depsecdef.html.....	3
www.defenselink.mil/news/Aug2003/	
D20030812factsheet.pdf.....	20
www.dtic.mil/whs/directives/corres/mco/	
Mco1.pdf.....	20
www.whitehouse.gov/news/releases/2001/09/	
20010920-8.html.....	19

GLOSSARY

ACLJ	American Center for Law and Justice
ANZUS Pact	Mutual Defense Agreement Between Australia, New Zealand, and the United States
Consolidated Reply	Petitioner's Consolidated Reply to Respondent's Return and Opposition to Cross Motion to Dismiss
Doswald-Beck Br.	Brief as Amicus Curiae of Louise Doswald-Beck, Guy S. Goodwin-Gill, Frits Kalshoven, Marco Sassoli, and the Center for International Human Rights of Northwestern University School of Law in Support of Salim Ahmed Hamdan's Petition for Writ of Mandamus Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1361 or, in the Alternative, Writ of Habeas Corpus
GC	Geneva Convention (IV) Relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War (Aug. 12, 1949)
GPW	Geneva Convention (III) Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War (Aug. 12, 1949)
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICRC Cmt	International Committee of the Red Cross Commentary (on the respective Geneva Convention being referred to)
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
OAS	Organization of American States